A Perfect Situation for Widening Participation and Success

But Is It A Perfect Storm or Perfect Opportunity?

Achieving Wider Access to Higher Education

Howard Samuels
Center, CUNY & Ford Foundation, New York, New York

February 25, 2010

Presentation by:
David Longanecker
President, Western Interstate Commission for Higher Education (WICHE)
The Perfect Storm: Three Converging Waves

Wave One: Our Economic Competitiveness

Wave Two: Who We Are – Can We Be Competitive

Wave Three: What We Have in Resources
The Liberal Borrowings

Knocking on the College Door (WICHE)

Beyond Social Justice (WICHE)


State Higher Education Executive Officers (SHEEO), SHEF Report, February 2010.
The Converging Waves

Wave One: Our Economic Competitiveness

Wave Two: Who We Are – Can We Be Competitive

Wave Three: What We Have in Resources
Relationship Between Educational Attainment, Personal Income, and Economic Strength

State New Economy Index (2002)

- Top Tier
- Middle Tier
- Low Tier

Source: NCHEMS
Percent of Population Ages 25-64 with a Bachelor’s Degree or Higher

Source: U.S. Census Bureau, 2007 American Community Survey. Via NCHEMS
Percent of Population Ages 25-64 with an Associate Degree

Source: U.S. Census Bureau, 2007 American Community Survey. Via NCHEMS
States Per Capita Income, 2007

Source: Regional Economic Information System, Bureau of Economic Analysis, U.S. Department of Commerce Via NCHEMS
Differences in College Attainment (Associate and Higher) Between Younger and Older Adults - U.S. and OECD Countries, 2005

Differences in College Attainment (Associate and Higher) Between Younger and Older Adults - U.S., 2005

Source: U.S. Census Bureau, 2005 ACS
The White Caps on the First Wave

- We’ve Been A Leader
- But Slip-Sliding Away
  - Losing Ground:
    - Mixed Bag Nationally
    - Falling Internationally
  - And One Size Doesn’t Fit All
    - Really Two Stories – The Haves & the Have Nots
- And the Perverse Public Policy Response
  - Question the data
  - Fight for Immigration Reform (Less and More)
The Converging Waves

Wave One: Our Economic Competitiveness

Wave Two: Who We Are – Can We Be Competitive

Wave Three: What We Have in Resources
WICHE Projections of High School Grads

Figure 3.9. Public High School Graduates in the West by Race/Ethnicity 1993-94 to 2004-05 (Actual), 2005-06 to 2021-22 (Projected)

Figure 3.15. Public High School Graduates in the South by Race/Ethnicity 1993-94 to 2004-05 (Actual), 2005-06 to 2021-22 (Projected)

WICHE Projections of High School Grads

Figure 3.11. Public High School Graduates in the Midwest by Race/Ethnicity 1993-94 to 2004-05 (Actual), 2005-06 to 2021-22 (Projected)

Figure 3.13. Public High School Graduates in the Northeast by Race/Ethnicity 1993-94 to 2004-05 (Actual), 2005-06 to 2021-22 (Projected)

High School Graduation Rates - Public High School Graduates as a Percent of 9th Graders Four Years Earlier, 2006

Source: Tom Mortenson, Postsecondary Opportunity Via NCHEMS
College-Going Rates – First-Time Freshmen Directly Out of High School as a Percent of Recent High School Graduates, 2006

Source: Tom Mortenson, Postsecondary Opportunity Via NCHEMS
Difference in Education Attainment Between Whites and Hispanics (2006, Percent)

Source: U.S. Census Bureau, 2006 American Community Survey (ACS) Public Use Microdata Sample (PUMS) File. Via NCHEMS
Difference Between Whites and Next Largest Race/Ethnic Group in Percentage of Adults Age 25-34 with an Associate Degree or Higher, 2000

Source: U.S. Census Bureau, PUMS (based on 2000 Census), Via NCHEMS
Patterns of U.S. High School and College Participation and Completion by Age (Average Annual from 2005 to 2007)

High School Participation

Earn High School Diploma or Equivalent – Levels off at Age 21

Undergraduate College Participation – Peaks at Age 19, Levels off at Age 30

Complete Undergraduate College Degree – Peaks and Levels off at Age 31

We are left with 13 percent of adults with no high school diploma, and 60 percent with no college degree.

Note: Includes associate and bachelor’s degrees, but not certificates.
Source: U.S. Census Bureau, 2005-07 American Community Survey (Public Use Microdata Sample)
Those with whom we have succeeded are declining.

Those with whom we have not succeeded are increasing.

“Average” won’t sustain us, and may not even be achievable.

And, and One Size Doesn’t Fit All.

Really Two Stories – The Haves & the Have Nots.
The White Caps on the Second Wave

And the Perverse Public Policy Response

- Mission Creep
  - More focus on research
  - More focus on the highest achieving
    - Merit aid (institutional and state policy)
    - Enrolment caps, allowing creaming

- Challenges to affirmative action

- Relative comfort with the status quo
  - Including whining – it’s all their fault
    - Students for not being white
    - States for not being supportive
    - Feds for not willing to give lots with nothing in return
The Converging Waves

Wave One: Our Economic Competitiveness

Wave Two: Who We Are – Can We Be Competitive

Wave Three: What We Have in Resources
Life could have been worse


Source: SHEEO, SHEF 2008
Revenues Per Student from Net Tuition, State, & Local Appropriations Public Research

Revenues Per Student from Net Tuition, State, & Local Appropriations: Public Masters and Baccalaureate

Revenues Per Student from Net Tuition, State, & Local Appropriations Public 2-Year

Projected State and Local Budget Surplus (Gap) as a Percent of Revenues, 2016

Source: NCHEMS; Don Boyd (Rockefeller Institute of Government), 2009 Via NCHEMS
Prospects look bleak for much more in the short term
New Normal suggests a very different future than past.
Triage often sacrifices the most vulnerable
And the Perverse Public Policy Response

- A stimulus package that discouraged innovation and change
- A funding structure that inadequately supports equity oriented institutions
- Mission creep, which reduces teaching productivity
- A few cuts in need-based aid (Illinois)
- Tax cuts
Demographics present a challenge, all else being equal.

The finances are perilous.

We have been educationally competitive, which has made us economically competitive and comparative, but:
- We're slipping
- And the good life has not been equitably distributed
- Public Policy inconsistent with the times or their needs.
Opportunity One: Our Economic Competitiveness

Opportunity Two: Our Changing Demographics

Opportunity Three: Our Revenue Base
Opportunity One: Our Economic Competitiveness

- We remain the wealthiest country in the World.
  We have “the financial capacity”
- Some Positive Policy Trends
  - Benchmarking to Global Indexes
Opportunity Two: Our Changing Demographics

- We start from a reasonably successful base, over all
- Improvements in serving students of color, particularly Hispanic students, will reap huge benefits
Opportunity Two: Our Changing Demographics

- Positive Policy Trends
  - Pay for Outcomes
    - Evidence based
    - Many focused on reducing the Gaps
  - Renewed focus on smart need-based student financial aid
    - Preservation
    - New Initiatives
- Less is More in the Curriculum
- Reinvention of Remediation (CAT)
- Broader adoption of the Equity Scorecard
- Federal Initiatives – SAFRA & AGI
Opportunity Two: Our Changing Demographics

- Positive Policy Trends
  - For Adult Students
  - More flexible financing
    - Amnesty
    - Payment plans
    - Tailored financial aid (Arkansas)
  - Concierge Service
Opportunity Three: Our revenue base

✓ Seems Dire
✓ And Is Daunting
✓ But reason for optimism
  ✓ Room for improvement in productivity
Tuition and Fees
State and Local

*Adjusted for value of degrees in the state employment market (median earnings by degree type and level)

Sources: SHEEO State Higher Education Finance Survey 2008; NCES, IPEDS Completions Survey; U.S. Census Bureau, American Community Survey (Public Use Microdata Samples)
Opportunity Three: Our revenue base

- Seems Dire
- And Is Daunting
- But reason for optimism
  - Room for improvement in productivity
  - Capacity in many states
State Tax Capacity & Effort
Indexed to U.S. Average

Source: State Higher Education Executive Officers (SHEEO)
Opportunity Three: Our revenue base

✓ Seems Dire
✓ And Is Daunting
✓ But reason for optimism
  ✓ Room for improvement in productivity
  ✓ Capacity in many states
✓ And only way to progress is to embrace the equity agenda – Beyond Social Justice
Opportunity One: Our Economic Competitiveness

Opportunity Two: Our Changing Demographics
- We start from a reasonably successful base, over all
- Improvements in serving Hispanic students will reap huge benefits

Opportunity Three: Our Revenue Base
- Productivity enhancements will be key to equity enhancements
- Many States & Feds have the capacity if it can develop the Will
- Feds will need to target funding to help those at capacity today.
The Colorado Story – Three Real Opportunities

Enough Already